

### 3

## YORK REGION TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE CONTRACTOR REPORT CARD

**The Transit Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendation contained in the following report dated March 31, 2009, from the Commissioner of Transportation Services.**

#### 1. RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that:

1. This report be received for information.

#### 2. PURPOSE

This report updates Regional Council on York Region Transit's Operations and Maintenance Contractor Report Card program for the third and fourth quarters of 2008 (see *Attachment 1* for 2008 accumulated results).

#### 3. BACKGROUND

**Since 2005, York Region Transit (YRT) has used a Contractor Report Card program to record and score contractor performance**

The report card provides staff with tools to monitor and report on the performance of the contractors that operate YRT and Viva services. The report card was introduced to Regional Council in September 2006, and is reported on a semi-annual basis.

#### 4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

##### **2008 CONTRACTOR REPORT CARD RESULTS OVERVIEW**

##### **YRT/Viva contractors continue to meet the Region's expectations overall**

The report card scores the conventional and Viva contractors on 22 performance standards identified in the performance-based operations and maintenance contract. The results of the accumulated Q1 through Q4 Contractor Report Card indicate that all contractors are meeting the Region's performance expectations overall. Where contractors fall below the benchmark established for each performance standard, staff initiate corrective action and work with the contractors to improve the deficient areas. The performance standards are described in detail in Table 1.

**Table 1**  
Performance Standards

	<b>Performance Standard</b>	<b>Measurement Period</b>	<b>Benchmark Score</b>
1A	<b>On-Time Departures</b> <i>% of on-time vehicle observations; departing no later than 5:00 minutes after the scheduled departure time</i>	Quarterly	90 – 95%
1B	<b>Operating Ahead of Schedule</b> <i>% of <b>not</b> early vehicle observations; no vehicle shall depart before its scheduled departure time for any reason</i>	Quarterly	100%
1C	<b>Missed Trips</b> <i>% of <b>not</b> missed trip observations; vehicles departing more than 20:00 minutes late shall be considered a missed trip</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
2A	<b>Kilometres Between Road Calls</b> <i>Average # of km per vehicle per in-service Road Call</i>	Quarterly	8,000 – 10,000 km
2B	<b>In-Service Wheelchair Lift / Ramp Failures</b> <i>% of vehicle observations with functioning wheelchair lifts / ramps</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
2C	<b>In-Service Air Conditioning / Heating</b> <i>% of vehicle observations with functioning HVAC systems</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
2D	<b>Preventative Maintenance Inspections</b> <i>% of incidences within 5,000 km PMI interval</i>	Quarterly	90 – 95%
2E	<b>Accident Damage Repairs</b> <i># of days beyond repair allowance for all vehicles</i>	Quarterly	Repair allowance of 20 days
2F	<b>In-Service Vehicle Damage Observations</b> <i>% of vehicle observations without body damage</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
2G	<b>Exterior Bus Clean</b> <i>% of vehicle observations with properly cleaned exteriors</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
2H	<b>Interior Bus Clean</b> <i>% of vehicle observations with properly cleaned interiors</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
3A	<b>CVOR</b> <i>Commercial Vehicle Operator's Registration; status of carrier safety rating</i>	Annually	Satisfactory – unaudited
3B	<b>Accidents</b> <i>Average kilometres per vehicle per preventable accident</i>	Quarterly	150,000 – 200,000 km
4A	<b>Customer Complaints<sup>2</sup></b> <i># of complaints per 100,000 passenger boardings</i>	Quarterly	10 – 15 complaints
4B	<b>Customer Satisfaction Survey</b> <i>(Biennial survey)</i>	Bi-Annually	70 – 90%
4C	<b>Marketing Materials</b> <i>% of vehicle observations with properly displayed Marketing information</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
5A	<b>Customer Service Training</b> <i>1/3<sup>rd</sup> of bus operators to receive 24 hours of CUTA Ambassador Training per year; pass/fail</i>	Annually	33%
5B	<b>Ongoing Bus Operator Training</b> <i>% of bus operators to receive 16 hours of ongoing training and 1 hour wheelchair lift / ramp training; pass/fail</i>	Annually	90 - 95%
5C	<b>Ongoing Diesel Technician Training</b> <i>% of diesel technicians to receive 12 hours of ongoing training; pass/fail</i>	Annually	80 – 100%
5D	<b>Destination Signs</b> <i>% of vehicle observations with accurate / operational destination signs</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
5E	<b>Bus Operator Appearance</b> <i>% of vehicle observations with drivers in proper attire</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
6A	<b>Management Reports and TW CARES Tickets<sup>4</sup></b> <i># of days late for all reports</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%

**6B Accident / Incident Reports<sup>3</sup>**

Quarterly

*# of days beyond reporting allowance for all accidents*

---

- Notes:
1. Average calculated using either three or four divisions, based on available data. (See Attachment 1, Report Card)
  2. Customer complaints for Veolia do not include issues regarding schedule adherence or fare dispute.
  3. Accident / Incident Reports to be submitted within 2 days of event.
  4. Veolia is scored only on TW CARES Tickets.

**The performance standards are used to determine whether or not the contractor exceeds, meets or falls below the benchmark**

Each quarter, random checks of service schedule adherence and equipment are performed by YRT Operations Inspectors. In addition, data pertaining to vehicle maintenance, accident reports, responses to customer concerns and personnel training is provided to YRT by the contractors. This data is submitted on a daily, monthly and annual basis as specified in the performance-based contract. The results of the YRT random checks and data collection are compiled and used to score each of the 22 performance standards.

Each of the 22 performance standards has been assigned a benchmark score. Scores are illustrated by a percentage, percentage range, or pass/fail. Scoring of the performance standard is done using 1, 2, or 3 scores, where:

1. Exceeds benchmark  
Contractor's score is greater than the benchmark score.
2. Meets benchmark  
Contractor's score is equal to the benchmark score.
3. Below benchmark  
Contractor's score is less than the benchmark score.

**First Student (formerly Laidlaw Transit) ranks third amongst the three conventional contractors**

First Student operates the YRT conventional transit service in the Newmarket, King, Aurora, East Gwillimbury and Georgina areas (North Division).

Performance standards scoring one (exceeding benchmark) or two (meeting benchmark) are listed in Table 2.

**Table 2**  
Performance Requirements Exceeding or Meeting Standard Benchmark  
(First Student)

<b>Exceeding Standard Benchmark</b>	<b>Meeting Standard Benchmark</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• In-service Wheelchair Lift/Ramp Failures</li><li>• In-service Air Conditioning/Heating</li><li>• Missed Trips</li><li>• Exterior Bus Clean</li><li>• In-Service Vehicle Damage</li><li>• Bus Operator Appearance</li><li>○ On-Time Departures</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Preventative Maintenance Inspections</li><li>• Commercial Vehicle Operators Registration</li><li>• Customer Complaints</li><li>• Customer Satisfaction Survey</li><li>• Marketing Materials</li><li>• Customer Service Training</li><li>• Ongoing Bus Operator Training</li><li>• Ongoing Diesel Technician Training</li><li>• Destination Signs</li></ul>

Performance standards scoring three (below standard benchmark) and indicating a need for improvement are listed below in Table 3.

**Table 3**  
Performance Requirements Below Standard Benchmark (First Student)

<b>Below Standard</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Operating Ahead of Schedule</li><li>• Kilometres Between Road Calls</li><li>• Interior Bus Clean</li><li>• Management Reports and TW CARES Tickets</li><li>• Accidents</li></ul>

### **Tokmakjian Transit ranks second overall**

Tokmakjian operates YRT's conventional transit service in the Vaughan and Richmond Hill areas (Southwest Division).

Performance standards scoring one (exceeding standard benchmark) or two (meeting standard benchmark) are listed in Table 4.

**Table 4**  
Performance Requirements Exceeding or Meeting Standard Benchmark  
(Tokmakjian)

<b>Exceeding Standard Benchmark</b>	<b>Meeting Standard Benchmark</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ In-Service Air Conditioning/Heating</li><li>● Missed Trips</li><li>○ Kilometres Between Road Calls</li><li>● On-Time Departures</li><li>● Exterior Clean</li><li>● Preventative Maintenance Inspections</li><li>● Commercial Vehicle Operators Registration</li><li>● Marketing Materials</li><li>● Customer Complaints</li><li>● Bus Operator Appearance</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>● In-Service Wheelchair Lift/Ramp Failures</li><li>● Customer Satisfaction Survey</li><li>● Accidents</li><li>● Customer Service Training</li><li>● Ongoing Bus Operator Training</li><li>● Ongoing Diesel Technician Training</li><li>● Management Reports and TW CARES Tickets</li></ul>

Performance standards scoring three (below standard benchmark) and indicating a need for improvement are listed in Table 5.

**Table 5**  
Performance Requirements Below Standard Benchmark (Tokmakjian)

<b>Below Standard Benchmark</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>● Operating Ahead of Schedule</li><li>● In-Service Vehicle Damage Observations</li><li>● Destination Sign</li><li>● Exterior Bus Clean</li><li>● Interior Clean</li></ul>

### **Miller Transit ranks first overall**

Miller operates YRT's conventional transit service in the Markham and Richmond Hill areas. (Southeast Division).

Performance standards scoring one (exceeding standard benchmark) or two (meeting standard benchmark) are listed in Table 6.

**Table 6**  
Performance Requirements Exceeding or Meeting Standard Benchmark (Miller)

<b>Exceeding Standard Benchmark</b>	<b>Meeting Standard Benchmark</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• On-Time Departures</li><li>• Missed Trips</li><li>• Kilometres Between Road Calls</li><li>• In-Service Wheelchair Lift/Ramp Failures</li><li>• In-Service Air Conditioning/Heating</li><li>• Marketing Materials</li><li>• Customer Complaints</li><li>• Bus Operator Appearance</li><li>• Management Reports and TW CARES Tickets</li><li>• Preventative Maintenance Inspections</li><li>• Destination Sign</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• In-Service Vehicle Damage Observations</li><li>• Customer Satisfaction Survey</li><li>• Exterior Bus Clean</li><li>• Commercial Vehicle Operators Registration</li><li>• Accidents</li><li>• Customer Service Training</li><li>• Ongoing Bus Operator Training</li><li>• Ongoing Diesel Technician Training</li></ul>

Performance standards scoring three (below standard benchmark) and indicating a need for improvement are listed in Table 7.

**Table 7**  
Performance Requirements Below Standard Benchmark (Miller)

<b>Below Standard Benchmark</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Operating Ahead of Schedule</li><li>• Interior Clean</li></ul>

**Veolia Transportation operates the Viva bus rapid transit service and is not ranked in comparison to the other three conventional bus operating contractors for various reasons**

These include:

- Buses are operated on an ‘accelerated’ basis maintaining equal spacing between buses as opposed to adhering to a bus stop to bus stop schedule. Staff monitor schedule adherence from beginning and end points on routes, typically at terminals, through both physical observation and the Computer Aided Dispatch/Automatic Vehicle Location (CAD/AVL) system.
- On-street operating conditions are somewhat different. Viva buses do not operate on the local road network and are only required to stop at Viva stations. These stations are spaced approximately one kilometre apart. Conventional bus stops are typically spaced every 250-300 metres.

- Veolia is operating the BRT service only. They are not required to operate services such as shuttles and school specials.
- Veolia has had the advantage of operating with all new buses since 2005.
- Veolia uses an off-board fare payment system which means there is little or no interaction between passenger and driver.

Performance standards scoring one (exceeding standard benchmark) or two (meeting standard benchmark) are listed in Table 8.

**Table 8**

Performance Requirements Exceeding or Meeting Standard Benchmark (Veolia)

<b>Exceeding Standard Benchmark</b>	<b>Meeting Standard Benchmark</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• On-Time Departure</li><li>• Preventative Maintenance Inspections</li><li>• Kilometres Between Road Calls</li><li>• Missed Trips</li><li>• In-Service Wheelchair Lift/Ramp Failure</li><li>• In-service Air Conditioning/Heating</li><li>• Accidents</li><li>• Customer Complaints</li><li>• Customer Satisfaction Survey</li><li>• Destination Sign</li><li>• Bus Operator Appearance</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Exterior Bus Clean</li><li>• Commercial Vehicle Operators Registration</li><li>• Marketing Materials</li><li>• Customer Service Training</li><li>• Ongoing Diesel Technician Training</li><li>• Ongoing Bus Operator Training</li></ul>

Performance standards scoring three (below standard benchmark) and indicating a need for improvement are listed below in Table 9.

**Table 9**

Performance Requirements Below Standard Benchmark (Veolia)

<b>Below Standard Benchmark</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Operating Ahead of Schedule</li><li>• In-Service Vehicle Damage Observations</li><li>• Interior Clean</li><li>• Management Reports and TW CARES Tickets</li></ul>

## **CORRECTIVE MEASURES**

### **YRT staff continue to work with contractors to implement corrective measures to improve upon their overall performance**

Current initiatives include:

- Monthly review of report card data with contractors by both Operations and Fleet sections of YRT.
- Development of fleet-related technical instruction sheet processes and service criteria for contractors.
- Development of an electronic vehicle maintenance tracking database.
- Ensuring complete document control of defects found on vehicles by contractors. Currently, an inspection of 1/3 of the fleet's maintenance records is completed quarterly through a contract audit process.
- Additional meetings held with contractors that focus solely on fleet-related issues. This includes a review of fleet maintenance and parts warranty issues, and mechanic training requirements.
- Several recommendations from the Ontario Safety League's review of contractor hiring and operator training program and practices implemented by contractors, including:
  - Hiring of additional training staff.
  - Limiting training sessions to smaller groups to encourage more interaction and participation.
  - YRT staff participation in various contractor training sessions such as Farebox Usage and Maintenance, CUTA Ambassador classes, Pre and Post Vehicle Inspection refresher.
  - Relocation of employee files to a more secure area.
- Continue to conduct monthly operations meetings with contractors to discuss service issues, resource issues, and operator training requirements.
- Quarterly meetings of the Driver Training and Communications Team continue. The team is made up of YRT, Risk Management and contractor staff. The team's focus is the development of training practices and procedures for the bus operators, "Safety First".
- Continue to work with each contractor to improve and investigate various cleaning practices pertaining to interior and exterior bus cleaning. Interior bus cleaning continues to be a challenge as, unlike most other transit systems, YRT and Viva buses are stored outside, which poses a particular cleaning challenge in winter months. The contractors have taken steps to improve quality control including hiring new contractors and improving work oversight.
- YRT staff has implemented the initial stages of an updated fleet audit process. This will improve the monitoring of bus maintenance and condition and will, in addition to other benefits, result in better bus body condition and fewer in-service breakdowns.

## 5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

### **Incentives paid to the conventional bus operating contractors as of December 31, 2008 total \$186,500**

Incentive payments are made to the conventional contractors based on data collected pursuant to the performance-based contract. This program is not currently applied to Veolia Transportation, the Viva operator. Each contractor has the opportunity to receive up to a total of \$144,000 in incentive payments during each contract year. Contractors receive incentives for individual performance standards when they exceed the benchmark score. Disincentives are levied against the contractor when they do not meet the benchmark score.

Incentive payments made to the conventional contractors in 2007 versus 2008 are outlined in Table 10.

**Table 10**  
Performance Payments to the Conventional Contractors

<b>Contractor</b>	<b>2007 Incentives</b>	<b>2008 Incentives</b>
First Student	\$40,300	\$44,200
Miller Transit	\$33,700	\$68,100
Tokmakjian	\$54,100	\$74,200
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$128,100</b>	<b>\$186,500</b>

\*Each performance standard has a different value. Incentive payments to the contractor are determined by the number of performance standards exceeded by the contractor and the value associated with those performance standards.

The funding required for the maximum incentive payments to the contractor are included in the operating budget each year.

## 6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

Transit customers from the local municipalities benefit from the Contractor Report Card Program through the continual monitoring of service, and the identification of areas in need of improvement. This ensures that customers will continue to receive quality public transit services.

## **7. CONCLUSION**

The Contractor Report Card provides staff with another management tool to continually monitor the performance of transit operations and maintenance contractors, and identify opportunities for quality improvement.

The 2008 accumulated Operations and Maintenance Contractor Report Card summary is attached as *Attachment 1*.

For more information on this report, please contact Ann-Marie Carroll, Manager, Operations, (Ext. 5677), of the Transit Branch of Transportation Services.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

*(The attachment referred to in this clause is attached to this report.)*