

4

CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR DETAILED DESIGN CONTRACT ADMINISTRATION AND SITE INSPECTION LAGOONS CONVERSION TO HABITAT WETLANDS SUTTON, SCHOMBERG, HOLLAND LANDING AND MOUNT ALBERT

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendations contained in the following report, December 18, 2007, from the General Manager, Water and Wastewater:

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:

1. The consulting engineering firm of Cole Engineering Group Ltd. be engaged to undertake the detailed design, contract administration and site inspection for Lagoons Conversion to Habitat Wetlands Project as outlined in this report, at an upset limit cost of \$664,919.98, including GST.
2. The Regional Chair and Regional Clerk be authorized to execute a formal agreement with Cole Engineering Group Ltd. for the completion of these engineering services, subject to review by Legal Services.

2. PURPOSE

This report seeks Council authorization to retain engineering services related to the Lagoons Conversion to Habitat Wetlands Project.

The Purchasing By-law requires Council authorization to award Request for Proposals (RFP) over \$500,000 or when the recommended proponent does not have the lowest cost. In this case, the recommended proponent has the highest score and second lowest cost, but the cost is greater than \$500,000. Therefore, Council authorization is required.

3. BACKGROUND

3.1 Environmental Assessment (EA)

The Environmental Study Report (ESR) for the Class Environmental Assessment for the wastewater lagoons in Sutton, Schomberg, and Mount Albert were approved under the provisions of the *Environmental Assessment Act*. A notice of completion has been filed for Holland Landing, but has not been approved as of yet. The Region now intends to move forward with the implementation phase for the Lagoon Conversion at Sutton, Schomberg and Mount Albert.

3.2 Request for Proposals (RFP)

In accordance with the Purchasing By-law, the Region invited proposals (P-07-57) from qualified consultants to provide engineering services to complete the detailed design, contract administration and site supervision for the Lagoons Conversion to Habitat Wetlands Project.

The following firms submitted a proposal:

- CH2M Hill Canada Limited.
- Cole Engineering Group Ltd.
- Dillon Consulting Limited.

3.2.1 Scope of Work

As per the RFP, the project will be delivered using the design/tender/construction approach. In order to facilitate the project in a co-ordinated manner, it is intended to retain the services of a single consultant to provide complete engineering services during the following stages of the project.

Detailed Design and Tendering

- Pre-Design.
- Design.
- Approvals.
- Tender and award.

Construction

- Pre-Construction.
- Notifications.
- Construction (contract administration and site inspection).
- Training.
- Commissioning.
- Completion (substantial performance, facility assumption, total performance, final documents, manuals and record drawings).
- Warranty period.

3.2.2 Project Works

The detailed design drawings and contract documents are to be prepared for the bidders to tender for construction services. The major works to be completed under this project includes the following:

- Provide emergency overflow/bypass storage capabilities.
- Modify inflow and outflow piping for the emergency bypass overflow.
- Minimal inflow piping system changes for top-up flow to the wetland.
- Maximize habitat enhancements.

- Incorporate recreational facilities.

The location plans (*see Attachments 1, 2, 3 and 4*) showing the project works are appended.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

The proposals were evaluated using the two envelope system with technical and financial information kept in separate envelopes. The technical proposal was evaluated prior to any knowledge of financial information. Technical content was weighted at 80%. The Region's proposal evaluation team reviewed the technical/management proposal based on, but not solely limited to, the following criteria for the proponent's project team experience and project implementation:

4.1 Proponent Project Team Experience

- Stability and reputation of the firm with the Region and/or other owners/clients.
- Experience on similar projects, municipal and/or other.
- Project manager(s) and key staff experience.
- Technical support staff experience.
- Staff training.
- Sub-consultant's experience.
- Other miscellaneous issues.

4.2 Project Implementation

- Completeness and comprehensiveness of the proposal submission.
- Understanding of the project and the services to be provided.
- Viability of the approach methodology.
- Understanding of the deliverables to be provided.
- Project management approach including planning and scheduling of key activities and resources.
- Implementation of the quality assurance and quality control process and its deliverables.
- Approach to health and safety.
- Other miscellaneous aspects of the project.

The financial evaluation composed the remaining 20% weight of the total evaluation. The technical and financial results are summarized in Table 1 below.

Table 1
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary

Firm	Technical Score (Out of 80)	Upset Fee (incl GST)	Financial Score (Out of 20)	Total Score (Out of 100)	Proposal Price/ Technical Score
Cole Engineering Group Ltd./Gartner Lee Ltd.	52.3	\$664,919.98	18.7	71.0	\$12,713.57/ Point
Dillon Consulting Limited	48.6	\$622,750.00	20.0	68.6	\$12,813.79/ Point
CH2M Hill Canada Limited	N/A	UNOPENED	N/A	N/A	N/A

The firm with the highest total score was Cole Engineering Group Ltd. given that the second highest score was within five points of the highest total score, a “Dollar Cost Per Technical Point” analysis was conducted. Cole Engineering Group Ltd. had the lowest cost per technical point at \$12, 713.57.

Cole Engineering Group Ltd. scored higher than the other proponents in the areas of staff experience, completeness and comprehensiveness of their proposal and its deliverables. The project team proposed by Cole Engineering Group Ltd., included Gartner Lee Ltd., as a sub-consultant. Gartner Lee Ltd. are a reputable Environmental Services firm with expertise in natural habitats, fisheries and ecology.

Cole Engineering Group Ltd. proposal clearly demonstrated their capabilities to provide the engineering services required to satisfy the RFP. As such, their proposal represents the best overall value to the Region.

CH2M Hill did not achieve the minimum score of 60% (48 out of 80) on their technical and management proposal, therefore, their financial proposal was not considered and will be returned to them unopened.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The upset limit fee for the proposed work is \$664,919.98, including GST. Sufficient funds are included in the 2007 Budget and Business plan for this assignment.

Payment for engineering services during construction is based on contract duration. Lump sum prices for contract administration and site inspection are included for 120 and 200 regular working days, respectively, within the financial proposal. If actual contract duration varies from the above estimated working days, then the payments to the consultant will be adjusted on a pro-rated basis using the per diem costs derived from the fee proposal.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

Once completed, the Lagoons Conversion to Habitat Wetlands Project will contribute to a naturalized habitat for plant and animal species, improve surrounding air quality, enhance aesthetic appearance and provide a green space for public use and enjoyment.

The Township of King has expressed a desire to use the Schomberg Lagoon site for the possible placement of recreational ball diamonds, rather than habitat wetlands. Regional staff have met with King Township to discuss the suitability of this land for recreational purposes.

The current proposal to convert the Schomberg Lagoon site to habitat wetlands remains the preferred option for the Region based on previous Council direction. The consultant will start detailed design of the other three sites prior to commencing the detailed design for the Schomberg Lagoon conversion in order to allow the Township of King to finalize their request to the Region for the lands.

7. CONCLUSION

The consultants' proposals for this project were evaluated in accordance with Regional procedures. It is recommended that Cole Engineering Group Ltd. be engaged to undertake the detailed design, contract administration and site inspection for the Lagoons Conversion to Habitat Wetlands Project at the upset limit cost of \$664,919.98, including GST.

For more information on this report, contact Bala Araniyasundaran, extension 5131, Director, Capital Delivery of the Water and Wastewater Branch in Environmental Services.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

(The attachments referred to in this clause were included in the agenda for the January 16, 2008 Committee meeting.)